

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND THE CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION 03:18 PM

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement Policies.

Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

Energy Commission Docket 07-OIIP-01

REPLY COMMENTS OF PACIFICORP (U 901 E) ON ISSUES RELATED TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF GREENHOUSE GAS (GHG) EMISSIONS ALLOWANCES

Kyle L. Davis PacifiCorp 825 NE Multnomah, 20th Floor Portland, OR 97232

Telephone: 503-813-6601 Facsimile: 503-813-6060

Email: Kyle.L.Davis@pacificorp.com

Date: November 14, 2007

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND THE CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement Policies.

Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

Energy Commission Docket 07-OIIP-01

REPLY COMMENTS OF PACIFICORP (U 901 E) ON ISSUES RELATED TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF GREENHOUSE GAS (GHG) EMISSIONS ALLOWANCES

Pursuant to the *Administrative Law Judge's Ruling Requesting Comments and Noticing Workshop on Allowance Allocation Issues* dated October 15, 2007, PacifiCorp respectfully submits these reply comments addressing comments submitted by the parties on October 31, 2007, and raised during the subsequent joint workshop held November 5, 2007, on issues related to the distribution of greenhouse gas ("GHG") emission allowances. PacifiCorp appreciates the opportunity to provide further comments in this proceeding on these important issues.

I. DISCUSSION

PacifiCorp has reviewed parties' October 31, 2007 comments, as well as the comments made during the November 5, 2007 workshop. Given the volume of information and the challenges with responding to individual comments, PacifiCorp will follow the lead of various other parties during the joint workshop and articulate a more precise position on allowance allocation issues. PacifiCorp's position was highly fragmented in the initial set of comments because parties were asked to respond to specific questions.

A. Should Emissions Allowances Be Auctioned or Allocated?

Unlike most other California investor-owned utilities, PacifiCorp is a vertically-integrated utility owning approximately 80 percent of its generation portfolio, most of which is located outside the state. The rate impact risks to PacifiCorp's customers are disproportionately higher compared to the customers of other California utilities who have already divested themselves of fossil generation. Those deregulated utilities have had, for several years, the ability to contract away any potential stranded cost risk, while also placing new construction risk squarely on independent generators competing for their business.

PacifiCorp supports a free allocation of GHG emission allowances based upon the "grandfathering" or historical emissions method, which would place PacifiCorp in a better position to manage any adverse rate impacts on PacifiCorp's California customers. To the extent California decides to opt for the auction method, PacifiCorp encourages the state to adopt an approach that transitions from a free allocation of allowances, based upon historic emissions, to an auction in a manner that avoids rate shock.

PacifiCorp reiterates that the decisions to build fossil fuel power plants, which were made over many decades and were intended to achieve a fuel mix, were economically rational and in virtually all cases approved as prudent by regulatory authorities. Load serving entities and their customers should not be punished for past prudent decisions. PacifiCorp also vigorously opposes providing GHG emission allowances to non-emitters based on a "benchmarking" or megawatt-hour "output-based" methodologies. It will simply create large wealth transfers among utilities unrelated to the overall goal of emissions reduction. It is unclear what public purpose would be served by distributing allowances to non-emitters. Utilities that built hydroelectric dams many decades ago or nuclear plants in the sixties and seventies did not do so to avoid carbon dioxide emissions and there is no reason to provide them with a financial windfall. These zero-emitting resources do not bear the burden or the direct costs of effectuating greenhouse gas emissions reductions.

B. <u>How Should Allowances Be Distributed?</u>

PacifiCorp's opening remarks posited dividing the annual GHG emission allowance budget into three separate distributions: 1) a new entrant set-aside; 2) free allocations to emitters; and 3) an auction. As PacifiCorp urged within its earlier remarks, the amount budgeted for each should be the subject of further modeling with a goal of achieving the best combination of cost, fairness, and enforceability.

1. <u>Free Allocation for New Entrant Set-Aside</u>

PacifiCorp supports some nominal amount (< 3 percent) of the overall GHG emission allowance cap being set aside each year for new market entrants (with projects that will produce GHG emissions) prior to the distribution of the GHG emission allowances. PacifiCorp recommends that a load-based CO₂ cap-and-trade rule include a specific provision for new entrants, such as new self-generators who had not been previously served by a load serving entity, where the state would hold a "new entrant" GHG emission allowance set-aside each year. At the end of each year, the state would pro-rate any unused "new entrant" allowances to the various regulated entities. The California Air Resources Board would set the size of the allowance pool in rule.

2. <u>Free Allocation to Existing Emitters</u>

PacifiCorp proposed using 95 percent of the now adjusted annual GHG emission allowance budget for free GHG emission allowance allocations to existing emitters (i.e., which would either be the load serving entity under a load-based cap-and-trade approach or the load serving entity, an-state generator, or some combination of the two to accommodate the first seller/deliverer approach). To establish each existing emitter's share of the allocation, a statewide GHG baseline would need to be calculated using the most recent emissions data.

PacifiCorp supports calculating a statewide GHG baseline using multiple

historical years.¹ A baseline should rely on historical CO₂ emissions data from all existing emitters, using data from a five year period prior to the rule's effective start date. California would drop data from the years with the highest and lowest emissions for each existing emitter. Average emissions for the three remaining years would form the basis for distributing GHG emission allowances to each existing emitter. The sum of all existing emitters' GHG baseline emissions would establish the GHG baseline, with each existing emitters' three-year average emissions used to calculate its share (or ratio) of the initial GHG baseline and each subsequent year's GHG emission allowance budget (i.e., the declining emissions cap). Note, the ratio would not change, regardless of the decline in the overall cap or in the case of a gradual transition to an auction method for distributing allowances. This predictability is extremely valuable for new fossil-fueled resource development.

3. **Auction Allocation**

PacifiCorp has expressed support for some nominal level of auction (≤ 5 percent) regardless of the regulatory approach to ensure GHG emission allowance market liquidity and an opportunity for trading. PacifiCorp also supports the state conducting at least two auctions a year. To the extent auction proceeds are returned to the load serving entities to manage the rate impacts, as has been suggested by some participants, PacifiCorp concurs that the increased cost of the auction method on customer rates could be partially mitigated. PacifiCorp supports auction proceeds returning to the electricity sector and their use toward achieving the overall goal of GHG emissions reductions.

However, under any auction method, PacifiCorp continues to be concerned about the creation of artificial scarcity. Where GHG emission allowances are auctioned, there is a risk of, and, indeed, an incentive for, non-generators bidding to acquire allowances. Financial

¹ When establishing a GHG baseline, evaluating a larger number of years allows the state to more equitably address year-over-year hydro production variability and accommodate unit-specific concerns, such as reduced emissions as a result of scheduled maintenance or unscheduled outages.

speculators could participate, hoping to acquire allowances cheaply and sell them to companies that need them to operate at a higher price. The risk alone could drive up the bid price in these auctions. As the cost of acquiring allowances eventually will be passed on the California electricity consumers, market manipulation that drives up the cost of allowances, the supply of which will be limited, should be prevented.

Restricting auction participation is the most direct way to address this risk. Rules for bidders could include either currently being a first-seller of electricity in California, having a pending application for a California-based generation unit, or being able to show to the satisfaction of regulatory staff that they have a good faith and reasonable expectation that they will be a first seller in California during the compliance period for which the allowances apply—coupled with administrative/criminal penalties if they are shown not to have pursued such plans in good faith during the compliance period.

C. Other "GHG Emission Allowance" Design Considerations

PacifiCorp supports California adopting a GHG emission allowance banking provision, whereby an owner could "bank" any surplus allowance for use within a future compliance period. However, to address artificial scarcity, auctioned allowances should have an identified expiration date, such as two years from the date of auction. Such a rule would ensure market liquidity.

PacifiCorp respectfully requests that the Commission carefully consider the impact of its GHG rules on PacifiCorp and other small multi-jurisdictional utilities (collectively, "SMJUs"). The combination of utility-owned generating resources and resources providing contracted for power located throughout the western United States, coupled with load-serving responsibilities and multi-state cost structures, places SMJUs in the complicated position of having to equitably assign the costs of system energy, including emissions/allowances, to each state's retail load. The Commission has recognized the unique implementation issues facing SMJUs, most notably within the Renewable Portfolio Standard Program, R.06-02-012. Unlike

large California investor-owned utilities, PacifiCorp's generating assets and power purchases are not used exclusively to serve California retail load and PacifiCorp does not rely significantly on unspecified power purchases.

II. CONCLUSION

The distribution method proposed by PacifiCorp will inherently minimize the rate impacts for its customers as well as those of other existing emitters. These customers bear the greatest direct cost of complying with the new rule. PacifiCorp's preferred method preserves the integrity of the emissions cap and allows the regulated entity to more easily manage and plan for an ever-declining allowance allocation.

The proponents of alternative GHG emission allowance distribution methods bear the burden of demonstrating to the Commission that their preferred approach will avoid rate shocks not only to PacifiCorp's customers, but to the customers of other similarly situated existing emitters. As stated before, PacifiCorp believes its preferred distribution method should be the subject of further modeling and optimized to achieve the best combination of cost, fairness, and enforceability.

PacifiCorp appreciates the opportunity to submit reply comments on issues raised by the parties related to the distribution of GHG emission allowances. For all the foregoing reasons, PacifiCorp recommends that the Joint Staff adopt PacifiCorp's preferred GHG emission allowance distribution method and, in the alternative, consider developing an allowance distribution method for SMJUs and their unique circumstances.

Dated: November 14, 2007

By

7842 Davi.

Kyle L. Davis Manager of Environmental Policy & Strategy PacifiCorp 825 NE Multnomah Portland, OR 97232 (503) 813-6601 Phone (503) 813-7247 Fax

E-Mail: Kyle.L.Davis@PacifiCorp.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Lisa Vieland, certify that I have on this 14th day of November 2007 caused a copy of the foregoing

REPLY COMMENTS OF PACIFICORP (U 901 E) ON ISSUES RELATED TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF GREENHOUSE GAS (GHG) EMISSIONS ALLOWANCES

to be served on all known parties to R.06-04-009 listed on the most recently updated service list available on the California Public Utilities Commission website, via email to those listed with email and via U.S. mail to those without email service. I also caused courtesy copies to be hand-delivered as follows:

Commissioner President Michael R. Peevey California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5218 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102 ALJ Charlotte TerKeurst California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5117 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

ALJ Jonathan Lakritz California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5020 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 14th day of November 2007 at San Francisco, California.

/s/ Lisa Viela	nd
Lisa Vieland	

Service List R.06-04-009 Last Updated 11/13/07

CINDY ADAMS cadams@covantaenergy.com

STEVEN S. SCHLEIMER steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com

STEVEN HUHMAN steven.huhman@morganstanley.com

RICK C. NOGER rick_noger@praxair.com

KEITH R. MCCREA keith.mccrea@sablaw.com

ADAM J. KATZ ajkatz@mwe.com

CATHERINE M. KRUPKA ckrupka@mwe.com

LISA M. DECKER lisa.decker@constellation.com

CATHY S. WOOLLUMS cswoollums@midamerican.com

KEVIN BOUDREAUX kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com

THOMAS DILL trdill@westernhubs.com

E.J. WRIGHT ej_wright@oxy.com

PAUL M. SEBY pseby@mckennalong.com

TIMOTHY R. ODIL todil@mckennalong.com

STEPHEN G. KOERNER, ESQ. steve.koerner@elpaso.com

JENINE SCHENK jenine.schenk@apses.com

JOHN B. WELDON, JR. jbw@slwplc.com

KELLY BARR kelly.barr@srpnet.com

ROBERT R. TAYLOR rrtaylor@srpnet.com

STEVEN S. MICHEL smichel@westernresources.org

ROGER C. MONTGOMERY roger.montgomery@swgas.com

LORRAINE PASKETT Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com

RONALD F. DEATON ron.deaton@ladwp.com

SID NEWSOM snewsom@semprautilities.com

DAVID L. HUARD dhuard@manatt.com

CURTIS L. KEBLER curtis.kebler@gs.com

DENNIS M.P. EHLING dehling@klng.com

GREGORY KOISER gregory.koiser@constellation.com

NORMAN A. PEDERSEN npedersen@hanmor.com

MICHAEL MAZUR mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com

VITALY LEE vitaly.lee@aes.com

TIFFANY RAU tiffany.rau@bp.com

GREGORY KLATT klatt@energyattorney.com

RICHARD HELGESON rhelgeson@scppa.org

DANIEL W. DOUGLASS douglass@energyattorney.com

PAUL DELANEY pssed@adelphia.net

AKBAR JAZAYEIRI akbar.jazayeri@sce.com

ANNETTE GILLIAM annette.gilliam@sce.com

CATHY A. KARLSTAD cathy.karlstad@sce.com

LAURA I. GENAO Laura.Genao@sce.com

RONALD MOORE rkmoore@gswater.com

DON WOOD dwood8@cox.net

AIMEE M. SMITH amsmith@sempra.com

ALLEN K. TRIAL atrial@sempra.com

ALVIN PAK apak@sempraglobal.com

DAN HECHT dhecht@sempratrading.com

DANIEL A. KING daking@sempra.com

SYMONE VONGDEUANE svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com

THEODORE ROBERTS troberts@sempra.com

DONALD C. LIDDELL, P.C. liddell@energyattorney.com

MARCIE MILNER marcie.milner@shell.com

REID A. WINTHROP rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com

THOMAS DARTON tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com

STEVE RAHON lschavrien@semprautilities.com

GLORIA BRITTON GloriaB@anzaelectric.org

LYNELLE LUND llund@commerceenergy.com

TAMLYN M. HUNT thunt@cecmail.org

DIANE I. FELLMAN diane_fellman@fpl.com

JEANNE M. SOLE jeanne.sole@sfgov.org

JOHN P. HUGHES john.hughes@sce.com

LAD LORENZ llorenz@semprautilities.com

MARCEL HAWIGER marcel@turn.org

NINA SUETAKE nsuetake@turn.org

Diana L. Lee dil@cpuc.ca.gov

F. Jackson Stoddard fjs@cpuc.ca.gov

AUDREY CHANG achang@nrdc.org

DONALD BROOKHYSER rsa@a-klaw.com

EVELYN KAHL ek@a-klaw.com

KRISTIN GRENFELL kgrenfell@nrdc.org

MICHAEL P. ALCANTAR mpa@a-klaw.com

SEEMA SRINIVASAN sls@a-klaw.com

WILLIAM H. CHEN bill.chen@constellation.com

BRIAN K. CHERRY bkc7@pge.com

EDWARD G POOLE epoole@adplaw.com

ANN G. GRIMALDI agrimaldi@mckennalong.com

BRIAN T. CRAGG bcragg@goodinmacbride.com

JAMES D. SQUERI jsqueri@gmssr.com

JEANNE B. ARMSTRONG jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com

KAREN BOWEN kbowen@winston.com

LISA A. COTTLE lcottle@winston.com

SEAN P. BEATTY sbeatty@cwclaw.com

VIDHYA PRABHAKARAN vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com

JOSEPH M. KARP jkarp@winston.com

JEFFREY P. GRAY jeffgray@dwt.com

CHRISTOPHER J. WARNER cjw5@pge.com

SARA STECK MYERS ssmyers@att.net

LARS KVALE lars@resource-solutions.org

ANDREW L. HARRIS alho@pge.com

ANDREA WELLER aweller@sel.com

JENNIFER CHAMBERLIN jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com

BETH VAUGHAN beth@beth411.com

KERRY HATTEVIK kerry.hattevik@mirant.com

AVIS KOWALEWSKI kowalewskia@calpine.com

WILLIAM H. BOOTH wbooth@booth-law.com

J. ANDREW HOERNER hoerner@redefiningprogress.org

JANILL RICHARDS janill.richards@doj.ca.gov

CLIFF CHEN cchen@ucsusa.org

GREGG MORRIS gmorris@emf.net

R. THOMAS BEACH tomb@crossborderenergy.com

KENNETH C. JOHNSON kjinnovation@earthlink.net

BARRY F. MCCARTHY bmcc@mccarthylaw.com

C. SUSIE BERLIN sberlin@mccarthylaw.com

MIKE LAMOND Mike@alpinenaturalgas.com

JOY A. WARREN joyw@mid.org

UDI HELMAN UHelman@caiso.com

JOHN JENSEN jjensen@kirkwood.com

MARY LYNCH mary.lynch@constellation.com

LEONARD DEVANNA Irdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com

ANDREW BROWN abb@eslawfirm.com

BRUCE MCLAUGHLIN mclaughlin@braunlegal.com

GREGGORY L. WHEATLAND glw@eslawfirm.com

JANE E. LUCKHARDT jluckhardt@downeybrand.com

JEFFERY D. HARRIS jdh@eslawfirm.com

VIRGIL WELCH vwelch@environmentaldefense.org

WILLIAM W. WESTERFIELD, 111 www@eslawfirm.com

DOWNEY BRAND DOWNEY BRAND Sacramento Municipal 555 CAPITOL MALL, 10TH FLOOR SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-4686

RAYMOND J. CZAHAR, C.P.A. westgas@aol.com

STEVEN M. COHN scohn@smud.org

ANN L. TROWBRIDGE atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com

DAN SILVERIA dansvec@hdo.net

JESSICA NELSON notice@psrec.coop

DONALD BROOKHYSER deb@a-klaw.com

CYNTHIA SCHULTZ cynthia.schultz@pacificorp.com

KYLE L. DAVIS kyle.l.davis@pacificorp.com

RYAN FLYNN ryan.flynn@pacificorp.com

IAN CARTER carter@ieta.org

JASON DUBCHAK jason.dubchak@niskags.com

BRIAN M. JONES bjones@mjbradley.com

MATTHEW MOST EDISON MISSION MARKETING & TRADING, INC. 160 FEDERAL STREET BOSTON, MA 02110-1776

KENNETH A. COLBURN kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com

RICHARD COWART rapcowart@aol.com

KATHRYN WIG Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com

SAKIS ASTERIADIS sasteriadis@apx.com

GEORGE HOPLEY george.hopley@barcap.com

ELIZABETH ZELLJADT ez@pointcarbon.com

DALLAS BURTRAW burtraw@rff.org

VERONIQUE BUGNION vb@pointcarbon.com

KYLE D. BOUDREAUX kyle_boudreaux@fpl.com

ANDREW BRADFORD andrew.bradford@constellation.com

GARY BARCH gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com

RALPH E. DENNIS ralph.dennis@constellation.com

SAMARA MINDEL smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com

BARRY RABE brabe@umich.edu

BRIAN POTTS bpotts@foley.com

JAMES W. KEATING james.keating@bp.com

CYNTHIA A. FONNER Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation.com

JAMES ROSS jimross@r-c-s-inc.com

TRENT A. CARLSON tcarlson@reliant.com

GARY HINNERS ghinners@reliant.com

JEANNE ZAIONTZ zaiontj@bp.com

JULIE L. MARTIN julie.martin@bp.com

FIJI GEORGE fiji.george@elpaso.com

ED CHIANG echiang@elementmarkets.com

FRANK STERN fstern@summitblue.com

NADAV ENBAR nenbar@energy-insights.com

NICHOLAS LENSSEN nlenssen@energy-insights.com

ELIZABETH BAKER bbaker@summitblue.com

WAYNE TOMLINSON william.tomlinson@elpaso.com

KEVIN J. SIMONSEN kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com

SANDRA ELY Sandra.ely@state.nm.us

BRIAN MCQUOWN bmcquown@reliant.com

DOUGLAS BROOKS dbrooks@nevp.com

ANITA HART anita.hart@swgas.com

RANDY SABLE randy.sable@swgas.com

BILL SCHRAND bill.schrand@swgas.com

JJ PRUCNAL jj.prucnal@swgas.com

SANDRA CAROLINA sandra.carolina@swgas.com

CYNTHIA MITCHELL ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net

CHRISTOPHER A. HILEN chilen@sppc.com

ELENA MELLO emello@sppc.com

TREVOR DILLARD tdillard@sierrapacific.com

DARRELL SOYARS dsoyars@sppc.com

JOSEPH GRECO jgreco@caithnessenergy.com

FRANK LUCHETTI fluchetti@ndep.nv.gov

LEILANI JOHNSON KOWAL leilani.johnson@ladwp.com

RANDY S. HOWARD randy.howard@ladwp.com

ROBERT K. ROZANSKI Robert.Rozanski@ladwp.com

ROBERT L. PETTINATO robert.pettinato@ladwp.com

HUGH YAO HYao@SempraUtilities.com

RASHA PRINCE rprince@semprautilities.com

RANDALL W. KEEN rkeen@manatt.com

S. NANCY WHANG nwhang@manatt.com

PETER JAZAYERI pjazayeri@stroock.com

DEREK MARKOLF derek@climateregistry.org

DAVID NEMTZOW david@nemtzow.com

HARVEY EDER harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com

STEVE ENDO sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us

STEVEN G. LINS slins@ci.glendale.ca.us

TOM HAMILTON
THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET

BRUNO JEIDER bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us

RICHARD J. MORILLO rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us

ROGER PELOTE roger.pelote@williams.com

AIMEE BARNES aimee.barnes@ecosecurities.com

CASE ADMINISTRATION case.admin@sce.com

TIM HEMIG tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com

BARRY LOVELL bjl@bry.com

ALDYN HOEKSTRA aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com

YVONNE GROSS ygross@sempraglobal.com

JOHN LAUN jlaun@apogee.net

KIM KIENER kmkiener@fox.net

SCOTT J. ANDERS scottanders@sandiego.edu

JOSEPH R. KLOBERDANZ jkloberdanz@semprautilities.com

ANDREW MCALLISTER andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org

JACK BURKE jack.burke@energycenter.org

JENNIFER PORTER jennifer.porter@energycenter.org

SEPHRA A. NINOW sephra.ninow@energycenter.org

DESPINA NIEHAUS dniehaus@semprautilities.com

JOHN W. LESLIE ileslie@luce.com

ORLANDO B. FOOTE, III ofoote@hkcf-law.com

ELSTON K. GRUBAUGH ekgrubaugh@iid.com

THOMAS MCCABE EDISON MISSION ENERGY 18101 VON KARMAN AVE., SUITE 1700 IRVINE, CA 92612

JAN PEPPER pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com

GLORIA D. SMITH gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com

MARC D. JOSEPH mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com

HAYLEY GOODSON hayley@turn.org

MICHEL FLORIO mflorio@turn.org

DAN ADLER Dan.adler@calcef.org

MICHAEL A. HYAMS mhyams@sfwater.org

THERESA BURKE tburke@sfwater.org

NORMAN J. FURUTA norman.furuta@navy.mil

AMBER MAHONE amber@ethree.com

ANNABELLE MALINS annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk

DEVRA WANG dwang@nrdc.org

KAREN TERRANOVA filings@a-klaw.com

NORA SHERIFF nes@a-klaw.com

OLOF BYSTROM obystrom@cera.com

SETH HILTON sdhilton@stoel.com

SHERYL CARTER scarter@nrdc.org

ASHLEE M. BONDS abonds@thelen.com

CARMEN E. BASKETTE cbaskette@enernoc.com

COLIN PETHERAM colin.petheram@att.com

JAMES W. TARNAGHAN jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com

KEVIN FOX kfox@wsgr.com

KHURSHID KHOJA kkhoja@thelenreid.com

PETER V. ALLEN pvallen@thelen.com

SHERIDAN J. PAUKER spauker@wsgr.com

ROBERT J. REINHARD rreinhard@mofo.com

CALIFORNIA ENERGY MARKETS cem@newsdata.com

HOWARD V. GOLUB hgolub@nixonpeabody.com

JANINE L. SCANCARELLI jscancarelli@flk.com

JOSEPH F. WIEDMAN jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com

MARTIN A. MATTES mmattes@nossaman.com

JEN MCGRAW jen@cnt.org

LISA WEINZIMER lisa_weinzimer@platts.com

STEVEN MOSS steven@moss.net

SHAUN ELLIS sellis@fypower.org

ARNO HARRIS arno@recurrentenergy.com

ED LUCHA ELL5@pge.com

GRACE LIVINGSTON-NUNLEY gxl2@pge.com

JASMIN ANSAR jxa2@pge.com

JONATHAN FORRESTER JDF1@PGE.COM

RAYMOND HUNG RHHJ@pge.com

SEBASTIEN CSAPO sscb@pge.com

SOUMYA SASTRY svs6@pge.com

STEPHANIE LA SHAWN S1L7@pge.com

VALERIE J. WINN vjw3@pge.com

KARLA DAILEY karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org

FARROKH ALBUYEH farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net

DEAN R. TIBBS dtibbs@aes4u.com

JEFFREY L. HAHN jhahn@covantaenergy.com

ANDREW J. VAN HORN andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com

JOSEPH M. PAUL Joe.paul@dynegy.com

SUE KATELEY info@calseia.org

GREG BLUE gblue@enxco.com

SARAH BESERRA sbeserra@sbcglobal.net

MONICA A. SCHWEBS, ESQ. monica.schwebs@bingham.com

PETER W. HANSCHEN phanschen@mofo.com

JOSEPH HENRI josephhenri@hotmail.com

PATRICIA THOMPSON pthompson@summitblue.com

WILLIAM F. DIETRICH dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net

BETTY SETO Betty.Seto@kema.com

GERALD L. LAHR JerryL@abag.ca.gov

JODY S. LONDON jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net

STEVEN SCHILLER steve@schiller.com

MRW & ASSOCIATES, INC. mrw@mrwassoc.com

REED V. SCHMIDT rschmidt@bartlewells.com

ADAM BRIONES adamb@greenlining.org

STEVE KROMER stevek@kromer.com

CLYDE MURLEY clyde.murley@comcast.net

BRENDA LEMAY brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com

CARLA PETERMAN carla.peterman@gmail.com

EDWARD VINE elvine@lbl.gov

RYAN WISER rhwiser@lbl.gov

CHRIS MARNAY C Marnay@1b1.gov

PHILLIP J. MULLER philm@scdenergy.com

RITA NORTON rita@ritanortonconsulting.com

CARL PECHMAN cpechman@powereconomics.com

MAHLON ALDRIDGE emahlon@ecoact.org

RICHARD SMITH richards@mid.org

ROGER VAN HOY rogerv@mid.org

THOMAS S. KIMBALL tomk@mid.org

WES MONIER fwmonier@tid.org

BARBARA R. BARKOVICH brbarkovich@earthlink.net

JOHN R. REDDING johnrredding@earthlink.net

CLARK BERNIER clark.bernier@rlw.com

RICHARD MCCANN, PH.D rmccann@umich.edu

CAROLYN M. KEHREIN cmkehrein@ems-ca.com

CALIFORNIA ISO e-recipient@caiso.com

GRANT ROSENBLUM, ESQ. grosenblum@caiso.com

KAREN EDSON 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD FOLSOM, CA 95630

ROBIN SMUTNY-JONES rsmutny-jones@caiso.com

SAEED FARROKHPAY saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov

DAVID BRANCHCOMB david@branchcomb.com

KENNY SWAIN kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com

KIRBY DUSEL kdusel@navigantconsulting.com

GORDON PICKERING gpickering@navigantconsulting.com

LAURIE PARK lpark@navigantconsulting.com

DAVID REYNOLDS davidreynolds@ncpa.com

SCOTT TOMASHEFSKY scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com

ELLEN WOLFE ewolfe@resero.com

AUDRA HARTMANN Audra.Hartmann@Dynegy.com

BOB LUCAS
Bob.lucas@calobby.com

CURT BARRY curt.barry@iwpnews.com

DAN SKOPEC danskopec@gmail.com

DANIELLE MATTHEWS SEPERAS dseperas@calpine.com

DAVID L. MODISETTE dave@ppallc.com

DOUGLAS K. KERNER dkk@eslawfirm.com

JUSTIN C. WYNNE wynne@braunlegal.com

KASSANDRA GOUGH kgough@calpine.com

KELLIE SMITH kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov

KEVIN WOODRUFF kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com

MICHAEL WAUGH mwaugh@arb.ca.gov

PANAMA BARTHOLOMY pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us

PATRICK STONER pstoner@lgc.org

RACHEL MCMAHON rachel@ceert.org

RYAN BERNARDO bernardo@braunlegal.com

STEVEN A. LIPMAN steven@lipmanconsulting.com

STEVEN KELLY steven@iepa.com

WEBSTER TASAT wtasat@arb.ca.gov

EDWARD J. TIEDEMANN etiedemann@kmtg.com

LAURIE TEN HOPE Itenhope@energy.state.ca.us

JOSHUA BUSHINSKY bushinskyj@pewclimate.org

LYNN HAUG Imh@eslawfirm.com

OBADIAH BARTHOLOMY obartho@smud.org

BUD BEEBE bbeebe@smud.org

BALWANT S. PUREWAL bpurewal@water.ca.gov

DOUGLAS MACMULLLEN dmacmll@water.ca.gov

KAREN NORENE MILLS kmills@cfbf.com

KAREN LINDH karen@klindh.com

ELIZABETH W. HADLEY ehadley@reupower.com

DENISE HILL Denise_Hill@transalta.com

ANNIE STANGE sas@a-klaw.com

ELIZABETH WESTBY egw@a-klaw.com

ALEXIA C. KELLY akelly@climatetrust.org

ALAN COMNES alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com

KYLE SILON kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com

CATHIE ALLEN californiadockets@pacificorp.com

PHIL CARVER Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us

SAM SADLER samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us

LISA SCHWARTZ lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us

CLARE BREIDENICH cbreidenich@yahoo.com

DONALD SCHOENBECK dws@r-c-s-inc.com

JESUS ARREDONDO jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com

CHARLIE BLAIR charlie.blair@delta-ee.com

KAREN MCDONALD karen.mcdonald@powerex.com

CLARENCE BINNINGER clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov

DAVID ZONANA david.zonana@doj.ca.gov

Andrew Campbell agc@cpuc.ca.gov

Anne Gillette aeg@cpuc.ca.gov

Beth Moore blm@cpuc.ca.gov

Cathleen A. Fogel cf1@cpuc.ca.gov

Charlotte TerKeurst cft@cpuc.ca.gov

Christine S. Tam tam@cpuc.ca.gov

Donald R. Smith dsh@cpuc.ca.gov

Ed Moldavsky edm@cpuc.ca.gov

Eugene Cadenasso cpe@cpuc.ca.gov

Harvey Y. Morris hym@cpuc.ca.gov

Henry Stern hs1@cpuc.ca.gov

Jaclyn Marks jm3@cpuc.ca.gov

Jacqueline Greig jnm@cpuc.ca.gov

Jamie Fordyce jbf@cpuc.ca.gov

Jason R. Salmi Klotz jk1@cpuc.ca.gov

Jeorge S. Tagnipes jst@cpuc.ca.gov

Joel T. Perlstein jtp@cpuc.ca.gov

Jonathan Lakritz jol@cpuc.ca.gov

Judith Ikle jci@cpuc.ca.gov

Julie A. Fitch jf2@cpuc.ca.gov

Kristin Ralff Douglas krd@cpuc.ca.gov

Lainie Motamedi Irm@cpuc.ca.gov

Lana Tran ltt@cpuc.ca.gov

Matthew Deal mjd@cpuc.ca.gov

Nancy Ryan ner@cpuc.ca.gov

Pamela Wellner pw1@cpuc.ca.gov

Paul S. Phillips psp@cpuc.ca.gov

Pearlie Sabino pzs@cpuc.ca.gov

Rahmon Momoh rmm@cpuc.ca.gov

Richard A. Myers ram@cpuc.ca.gov

Sara M. Kamins smk@cpuc.ca.gov

Scott Murtishaw sgm@cpuc.ca.gov

Sean A. Simon svn@cpuc.ca.gov

Steve Roscow scr@cpuc.ca.gov

Theresa Cho tcx@cpuc.ca.gov

BILL LOCKYER ken.alex@doj.ca.gov

KEN ALEX ken.alex@doj.ca.gov

BALDASSARO DI CAPO bdicapo@caiso.com

JUDITH B. SANDERS jsanders@caiso.com

JULIE GILL jgill@caiso.com

MARY MCDONALD DIRECTOR OF STATE AFFAIRS CALIFORNIA INDEPENDENT SYSTEM OPERATOR CAISO 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD FOLSOM, CA 95630

PHILIP D. PETTINGILL ppettingill@caiso.com

MICHAEL SCHEIBLE mscheibl@arb.ca.gov

EVAN POWERS epowers@arb.ca.gov

JEFFREY DOLL jdoll@arb.ca.gov

PAM BURMICH pburmich@arb.ca.gov

B. B. BLEVINS bblevins@energy.state.ca.us

DARYL METZ dmetz@energy.state.ca.us

DEBORAH SLON deborah.slon@doj.ca.gov

Don Schultz dks@cpuc.ca.gov

KAREN GRIFFIN kgriffin@energy.state.ca.us

LISA DECARLO Idecarlo@energy.state.ca.us

MARC PRYOR mpryor@energy.state.ca.us

MICHELLE GARCIA mgarcia@arb.ca.gov

PIERRE H. DUVAIR pduvair@energy.state.ca.us

Wade McCartney wsm@cpuc.ca.gov

CAROL J. HURLOCK hurlock@water.ca.gov

HOLLY B. CRONIN hcronin@water.ca.gov

ROSS A. MILLER rmiller@energy.state.ca.us

PUC/X94356.v1